

EPHING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: District Development Management Committee **Date:** 24 February 2016

Place: Council Chamber, Civic Offices, High Street, Epping **Time:** 7.30 - 10.05 pm

Members Present: B Rolfe (Vice-Chairman), A Boyce, H Brady, R Butler, J Hart, R Jennings, J Knapman, G Mohindra, C C Pond, J M Whitehouse, K Chana, S Kane, J Philip and D Wixley

Other Councillors: -

Apologies: B Sandler, S Jones, H Kauffman, Y Knight and A Mitchell

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), J Doe (Senior Planning Officer), G J Woodhall (Senior Democratic Services Officer) and R Perrin (Webcasting Officer)

48. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Senior Democratic Services Officer reminded everyone present that the meeting would be broadcast live to the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

49. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION

The Chairman welcomed members of the public to the meeting and outlined the procedures and arrangements adopted by the Council to enable persons to address the Committee, in relation to the determination of applications for planning permission. The Committee noted the advice provided for the public and speakers in attendance at Council Planning Committee meetings.

50. SUBSTITUTE MEMBERS (COUNCIL MINUTE 39 - 23 JULY 2002)

The Committee noted the following substitutions for this meeting:

- (i) Cllr Philip for Cllr Jones;
- (ii) Cllr Wixley for Cllr Kauffman;
- (iii) Cllr Chana for Cllr Knight; and
- (iv) Cllr S Kane for Cllr Sandler.

51. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIRMAN

In the absence of the Chairman, who had tendered his apologies for the meeting, the Vice-Chairman had taken over the Chairmanship of the meeting, and invited

nominations for the role of Vice-Chairman.

Resolved:

(1) That Councillor A Boyce be elected Vice-Chairman for the duration of the meeting.

52. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Member Code of Conduct, Cllr H Brady declared a personal interest in the following item on the agenda, by virtue of being acquainted with the Applicant some years ago. The Councillor had determined that her interest was not pecuniary and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/1891/15 The Paddock, Grove Lane, Chigwell.

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Member Code of Conduct, Cllr J Knapman declared a personal interest in the following item on the agenda, by virtue of having been significantly involved in the process for the determination of this application. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not pecuniary and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/2701/15 Land at Brownings Farmhouse, Gravel Lane, Chigwell.

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Member Code of Conduct, Cllr J Philip declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda, by virtue of the Applicant being known to him. The Councillor had determined that this interest was not pecuniary and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/3058/15 The Drummonds, Sidney Road, Theydon Bois.

(d) Pursuant to the Council's Officer Code of Conduct, the Principal Planning Officer S Solon declared an interest in the following item on the agenda, by virtue of an objection to the application being raised by a family member. The Officer had determined that his interest was not pecuniary but would still leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/1891/15 The Paddock, Grove Lane, Chigwell.

53. MINUTES

Resolved:

(1) That the minutes of the meeting held on 2 December 2015 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record, subject to further clarification of the comments made by Cllr J Whitehouse in respect of minute item 43, EPF/1531/15 Garages Court North of 52 Stewards Green Road, Epping.

54. ORDER OF BUSINESS

As Cllrs C C Pond and R Jennings, both of whom represented wards in Loughton, had tended their apologies for lateness, due to inclement traffic congestion, it was proposed that the item concerning Pyrles Lane Nursery be deferred until after their arrival.

Resolved:

(1) That agenda item 7 – EPF/2254/15 Pyrles Lane Nursery, Loughton – be

deferred until after the arrival of Cllrs C C Pond and R Jennings.

55. EPF/1891/15 - THE PADDOCK, GROVE LANE, CHIGWELL

The Senior Planning Officer presented a report on the demolition of an existing stables and warehouse, and the erection of eight dwelling houses and associated landscaping at The Paddock, Grove Lane in Chigwell.

The Senior Planning Officer informed the Committee that this application had been considered by Area Planning Sub-Committee South on 3 February 2015, where it was refused in line with the Officer recommendation. Subsequently, four Members of the Sub-Committee stood to refer this application to this Committee for a final decision, under the Minority Reference rules within the Constitution.

The Senior Planning Officer stated that Grove Lane consisted of linear residential development with a Grade II Listed Building at the head of the road next to the application site, with an approximate 10 metre separation. The application site was currently an equestrian stables with low intensity use, and contained a number of low height equestrian buildings, hardstanding and equestrian facilities. The proposal sought permission for the demolition of the existing structures on the site and the erection of eight dwellings, an access road with parking and associated landscaping. The dwellings would form a linear development with the access road to the front and 23 parking spaces on the opposite side of the road. Four of the dwellings would be detached properties with four or five bedrooms, whilst the remaining four dwellings would be semi-detached properties with two bedrooms each. The site was within the metropolitan Green Belt, but it had been declared as previously developed land by a Planning Inspector at an appeal for a previous application at this site, which had been refused at Committee and dismissed at appeal.

Planning Officers had concluded that this revised application had still not overcome the previous reasons for refusal relating to impact on the Green Belt, the character of the area and the setting of the listed building. Consequently, the application was recommended for refusal.

The Committee noted the Summary of Representations received in relation to the application. There had been 16 letters of objection received, all from residents in Grove Lane. There had been three letters of support received, including from the Parish Council, and 1 qualified letter of support with concerns over the access to the open land. The Committee heard from an Objector, the Parish Council and the Applicant's Agent before proceeding to debate the application.

Cllr J Knapman acknowledged the views of the residents, but the nearby Waterworks was considered an industrial landscape, and this site was previously developed land. The section of the development that was previously felt to be affecting the openness of the Green Belt had been revised, and this was one of only two or three brownfield sites in Chigwell suitable for development. The Member feared that this site could be commercially developed or developed without permission when the new Planning Bill became law, and that the Council had an opportunity to control the development on the site with this application.

Other Members who offered support for the application highlighted that the development would be at the end of Grove Lane and would be an enhancement on the current site; the development would add to the openness of the Green Belt through the removal of the outbuildings currently in situ; and permission for the site to be developed needed to be granted now to prevent, potentially, twice as many dwellings being built on the site in the future. Councillor J Philip highlighted that the

Council needed new housing within the District and perhaps could not wait for the Green Belt Review to be completed. There was adequate parking provision being provided as part of the application as well as the transfer of the open land to the south of the application site to the Parish Council. The car movements for 8 dwellings would probably be less than the current equestrian use given that sizeable vehicles were likely to access the stables, and on balance the Member felt that there would be less impact on the immediate area from a development of houses than possible industrial development.

Cllr H Brady felt that the scheme was not sympathetic to the setting and that 8 dwellings should be considered overdevelopment. The Equestrian Centre should not be considered as a brownfield site, and this was not the right scheme for the location. Councillor J M Whitehouse added that such pockets of Green Belt land should be considered as part of the Green Belt Review before being removed from the Green Belt and made available for development. The increase in volume from this development was highlighted and that as the development would be closer to the Listed Building then it would have more of an impact. Other Members also expressed concerns about pre-empting the Review of Green Belt land within the District.

Cllr J Knapman added that possible development sites within Chigwell were being considered as part of the Neighbourhood Plan being developed by the Parish Council, and this application presented an opportunity to obtain control of the site now. The Member proposed that the application should be granted permission, with conditions appertaining to materials to be used, hours of working, wheel washing and landscaping. In addition, a Section 106 agreement should be signed by the Developer to transfer the proposed parcel of land to the Parish Council and make the proposed payment of £50,000 to the Parish Council to maintain the area in perpetuity. A number of standard conditions were also proposed by Members, along with the removal of Permitted Development rights at the site.

A number of Members commented that a list of planning conditions should have been prepared by the Officers to allow for the possibility of the Committee being minded to grant permission for the application.

Cllr C C Pond and Cllr R Jennings abstained from voting on the application, following a ruling by the Chairman, as they had been delayed by traffic congestion and had entered the meeting after consideration of the item had begun.

Resolved:

(1) That planning application EPF/1891/15 at The Paddock, Grove Lane in Chigwell be granted permission, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
2. The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: FJT_100, FJT_101 Rev A, FJT_200, FJT_201 Rev B, FJT_210 Rev B, FJT_211 Rev A, FJT_212 Rev A, FJT_213 Rev A, FJT_214 Rev A, FJT_220 Rev B, FJT_301 (dated Nov '15) and FJT_302 (dated Nov '15).
3. No construction works above ground level shall take place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes including doors, windows, guttering, downpipes, soffits and fascias have been submitted to and approved by the Local

Planning Authority, in writing. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.

4. No development shall take place until wheel washing or other cleaning facilities for vehicles leaving the site during construction works have been installed in accordance with details which shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved installed cleaning facilities shall be used to clean vehicles immediately before leaving the site.
5. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 2015 as amended (or any other Order revoking, further amending or re-enacting that Order) no development generally permitted by virtue of Classes A, B or E of Part 1 of Schedule 2 to the Order shall be undertaken without the prior written permission of the Local Planning Authority.
6. No development shall commence until a scheme to enhance the nature conservation interest of the site, to include the incorporation of one bat tube on the south facing wall of each house, has been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be implemented in full prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved.
7. No development shall take place, including site clearance or other preparatory work, until full details of both hard and soft landscape works (including tree planting) and implementation programme (linked to the development schedule) for the whole site including the area of land that is to be handed over to the Parish Council have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These works shall be carried out as approved. The hard landscaping details shall include, as appropriate, and in addition to details of existing features to be retained: proposed finished levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; other minor artefacts and structures, including signs and lighting and functional services above and below ground. The details of soft landscape works shall include plans for planting or establishment by any means and full written specifications and schedules of plants, including species, plant sizes and proposed numbers /densities where appropriate. If within a period of five years from the date of the planting or establishment of any tree, or shrub or plant, that tree, shrub, or plant or any replacement is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree or shrub, or plant of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
8. No development, including works of demolition or site clearance, shall take place until a Tree Protection Plan Arboricultural Method Statement and site monitoring schedule in accordance with BS:5837:2012 (Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction - recommendations) has been submitted to the Local Planning Authority and approved in writing. The development shall be carried out only in accordance with the approved documents unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

9. No development shall take place until details of the proposed surface materials for the parking and vehicular access have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. With the exception of within 6 metres of the highway boundary, for which no unbound material shall be used, the agreed surfacing shall be made of porous materials and retained thereafter or provision shall be made and retained thereafter to direct run-off water from the hard surface to a permeable or porous area or surface within the site. The agreed surface treatment shall be completed prior to the first occupation of the development or within 1 year of the substantial completion of the development hereby approved, whichever occurs first.
10. The carriageway of the vehicular access to the parking provision and the parking provision shall be constructed prior to the commencement of the erection of any dwelling proposed to have access from such a vehicular access. The footway commensurate with the frontage of each dwelling shall be completed prior to occupation of the dwellings they are to serve.
11. Gates shall not be erected on the vehicular access to the site without the prior written approval of the Local Planning Authority.
12. The parking area shown on the approved plan shall be provided prior to the first occupation of the development and shall be retained free of obstruction for the parking of residents and visitors vehicles.
13. Prior to first occupation of the proposed development, the developer shall be responsible for the provision to and implementation of for each dwelling a Residential Travel Information Pack for sustainable transport, approved by Essex County Council.
14. There shall be no discharge of surface water onto the highway.
15. A flood risk assessment and management and maintenance plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. The assessment shall include calculations of increased run-off and associated volume of storm detention using WinDes or other similar best practice tools. The approved measures shall be carried out prior to the substantial completion of the development and shall be adequately maintained in accordance with the management and maintenance plan.
16. No development shall take place until a Phase 1 Land Contamination investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 1 investigation. The completed Phase 1 report shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of any necessary Phase 2 investigation. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "*Model Procedures for the Management of Land*

Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the Phase 2 site investigation condition that follows]

17. Should the Phase 1 Land Contamination preliminary risk assessment carried out under the above condition identify the presence of potentially unacceptable risks, no development shall take place until a Phase 2 site investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 2 investigation. The completed Phase 2 investigation report, together with any necessary outline remediation options, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to any redevelopment or remediation works being carried out. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "Model Procedures for the Management of Land Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the remediation scheme condition that follows]

18. Should Land Contamination Remediation Works be identified as necessary under the above condition, no development shall take place until a detailed remediation scheme to bring the site to a condition suitable for the intended use has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved remediation scheme unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The remediation scheme must include all works to be undertaken, proposed remediation objectives and remediation criteria, timetable of works and site management procedures and any necessary long term maintenance and monitoring programme. The scheme must ensure that the site will not qualify as contaminated land under Part 2A of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 or any subsequent version, in relation to the intended use of the land after remediation.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the verification report condition that follows]

19. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme and prior to the first use or occupation of the development, a verification report that demonstrates the effectiveness of the remediation carried out must be produced together with any necessary monitoring and maintenance programme and copies of any waste transfer notes relating to exported and imported soils shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. The approved monitoring and maintenance programme shall be implemented.

20. In the event that any evidence of potential contamination is found at any time when carrying out the approved development that was not previously identified in the approved Phase 2 report, it must be reported in writing immediately to the Local Planning Authority. An investigation and risk assessment must be undertaken in accordance with a methodology previously approved by the Local Planning Authority. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme, a verification report must be prepared, which is subject to the approval in writing of the Local Planning Authority in accordance with the immediately above condition.
21. All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
22. No development shall take place until details of foul and surface water disposal have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such agreed details.
23. No bonfire shall be permitted on site throughout the demolition and construction phase of the development.
24. No development shall take place until details of levels have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority showing cross-sections and elevations of the levels of the site prior to development and the proposed levels of all ground floor slabs of buildings, roadways and access ways and landscaped areas. The development shall be carried out in accordance with those approved details.
25. Prior to commencement of the development the land as shown on approved drawing number FJT_302 "Parish Council Transfer" outlined in and shaded orange shall be permanently transferred to the ownership of Chigwell Parish Council at no cost together with the sum of fifty thousand pounds.

56. EPF/2254/15 PYRLES LANE NURSERY, LOUGHTON

The Principal Planning Officer presented a report for the demolition of the existing Nursery and the erection of up to 36 dwellings, 15 of which would be affordable units, at Pyrles Lane Nursery in Loughton. This was an application for outline planning consent and was before the Committee as it was considered a 'major' application where the Council was the land owner.

The Principal Planning Officer stated that the application site was triangular in shape with a narrow access road onto Pyrles Lane, and was located between Pyrles Lane, Hillyfields and the Hillyfields open space recreation area. The site was approximately 1 hectare in size, and was used by the District Council as a nursery site/grounds maintenance depot with various glasshouses, portacabins and parking areas. Part of the site had been designated for allotment use but this had not happened for some time. There was a footpath adjacent to the site which linked Pyrles Lane and

Hillyfields, but the site was not within the metropolitan Green Belt or a Conservation Area.

The Principal Planning Officer reported that the application was a revised proposal following the refusal of an earlier application in 2013. The application sought permission to demolish the existing nursery and depot site and erect 36 dwellings, a mixture of flats and houses, of which 15 would be affordable units. The application also included associated landscaping, parking and infrastructure. The revisions to the scheme included the provision of a wider access road, a reduction in the amount of accommodation provided, and an increase in parking spaces to 75. The maximum height of the proposed flats was 12.5 metres and 12 metres for the town houses. This was an outline application with all matters reserved, but the highways access had been detailed and the application included a revised Transport Assessment, Ecological report and Drainage report.

The Principal Planning Officer informed the Committee of some revisions to the published planning conditions. Condition 35 should read two years, not three years, for the development to commence from the date of the ecological study. In addition, there was an additional condition (36) to make the existing footpath hard surfaced along the whole length for use by residents.

Planning Officers had concluded that the reasons for refusal for the previous application on the grounds of highway safety and parking provision had been carefully addressed in this application. Consequently, it was recommended that outline planning permission be granted.

The Committee noted the summary of representations received in relation to this application. There had been 49 letters of objection received, including from Loughton Town Council and the Loughton Residents Association. The Highways Authority had no objections on policy or safety grounds to the proposed access road, and the District Council's Building Control section had confirmed that the proposed access road was wider than the minimum recommended for the access of Fire vehicles. A number of different agencies had no objections subject to the provision of standard conditions relating to trees, drainage, contamination, ecology, infrastructure and archaeology. The Committee heard from an Objector before proceeding to debate the application.

Cllr Wixley, who was the ward Member, was aware of the feelings of residents who backed onto this site and was concerned about the impact of this application on neighbouring properties, as 36 new dwellings seemed a high figure. It was also highlighted that the open space belonged to Loughton Town Council and that the Council should discuss further the proposal with the Town Council. Cllr Wixley welcomed the provision of additional parking spaces. Cllr Jennings suggested that the proposed dwellings at the north of the site could be moved a bit further away from the existing houses.

The Principal Planning Officer responded that the plan was indicative and the Committee was not approving the final layout. There appeared to be a 4 metre gap between the nearest new dwelling and existing garden but this issue could be dealt with when the final application was received. The existing footpath was not owned by Loughton Town Council and it was only intended to hard surface the existing pathway.

Cllr Pond was also very concerned about the relative proximity of the proposed flats to the houses in Pyrles Lane, with the possibility of overlooking, and felt that the reserved matters needed to come before the Committee. Cllr Pond also highlighted

that the land had been compulsory purchased in 1948 for use by permanent allotments and small holdings. Some small holdings were still in existence, so the land was allotment land and the Council would need to make an application to the Secretary of State to release this land for development. Allotment land was also protected under the Local Plan, and the Member would oppose this application as contrary to the Local Plan.

The Principal Planning Officer reassured the Committee that Officers did not have delegated powers to determine the reserved matters for this application, so it would be submitted to the Committee for determination. If planning permission was eventually granted for this application then any other necessary consents and permissions would still need to be obtained before any construction work could begin. The Council would have to obtain legal advice regarding whether an application to the Secretary of State was required.

Cllr Philip felt that the reasons for the refusal of the previous application had been dealt with, this development was not within the metropolitan Green Belt and not overly dense, and therefore would support it. Cllr Brady felt that this was a good site to develop as it was a redundant nursery and enclosed on three sides by existing housing, and the proposed blocks of flats were only three storeys in height. There had been no objections from the Highways Authority and the Member would support the application. Cllr Mohindra highlighted that if the land was sold to a developer then it was likely that the Committee would be considering a planning application for more than 36 dwellings.

The Principal Planning Officer confirmed that the layout, scale, appearance and landscaping were all reserved matters, as detailed in the second planning condition. The Officer also clarified that condition 22 dealt with the reinstatement of the parking lay-by to the south of the access to the footpath, and the access road would be sufficiently wide enough for two vehicles to pass each other.

Cllr Pond proposed that the application be refused on the grounds of non-compliance with the Council's Local Plan, seconded by Cllr Wixley, but this proposal was defeated.

Resolved:

(1) That outline planning permission is granted subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be commenced before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission or two years from the approval of the last of the reserved matters as defined in condition 2 below, whichever is the later.
2. (a) Details of the reserved matters set out below ("the reserved matters") shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval within three years from the date of this permission:
 - (i) layout;
 - (ii) scale;
 - (iii) appearance;
 - (iv) access; and
 - (v) landscaping.
- (b) The reserved matters shall be carried out as approved.

- (c) Approval of all reserved matters shall be obtained from the Local Planning Authority in writing before any development is commenced.
3. The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: TS DIAGRAM 3 Rev G, 1035/Additional/1.0 Rev A and a site location plan.
 4. No development shall take place, including works of demolition or site clearance, until an Arboricultural Implication Assessment and Tree Constraint plan, concurrently with the detailed site layout, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This should be drawn up in accordance with BS:5837:2012 (Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction - recommendations).
 5. A Landscape Management Plan, including long term design objectives, management responsibilities and maintenance schedules for all landscape areas, other than small, privately owned, domestic gardens, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to the occupation of the development or any phase of the development, whichever is the sooner, for its permitted use. The landscape management plan shall be carried out as approved.
 6. No development shall take place until a schedule of landscape maintenance for a minimum period of five years has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The schedule shall include details of the arrangements for its implementation. The landscape maintenance plan shall be carried out in accordance with the approved schedule.
 7. No development shall take place, including site clearance or other preparatory work, until full details of both hard and soft landscape works (including tree planting) and implementation programme (linked to the development schedule) have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These works shall be carried out as approved. The hard landscaping details shall include, as appropriate, and in addition to details of existing features to be retained: proposed finished levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; other minor artefacts and structures, including signs and lighting and functional services above and below ground. The details of soft landscape works shall include plans for planting or establishment by any means and full written specifications and schedules of plants, including species, plant sizes and proposed numbers /densities where appropriate. If within a period of five years from the date of the planting or establishment of any tree, or shrub or plant, that tree, shrub, or plant or any replacement is removed, uprooted or destroyed or dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree or shrub, or plant of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
 8. A flood risk assessment and management and maintenance plan shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. The assessment shall include calculations of increased run-off and associated volume

of storm detention using WinDes or other similar best practice tools. The approved measures shall be carried out prior to the substantial completion of the development and shall be adequately maintained in accordance with the management and maintenance plan.

9. No works shall take place until a detailed surface water drainage scheme for the site, based on sustainable drainage principles and an assessment of the hydrological and hydro geological context of the development, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The scheme shall subsequently be implemented prior to occupation. This should include:
 - limiting discharge rate to the 1 in 1 greenfield rate
 - providing the associated attenuation storage and providing an allowance for climate change and urban creep for the lifetime of the development.
 - Providing treatment in line with the CIRIA SuDS manual (C753).
10. No works shall take place until a scheme to minimise the risk of offsite flooding caused by surface water run-off and ground water during construction works has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority. The scheme shall be implemented as approved.
11. No works shall take place until a Maintenance Plan detailing the maintenance arrangements including who is responsible for different elements of the surface water drainage system and the maintenance activities/frequencies, has been submitted to and agreed, in writing, by the Local Planning Authority.
12. The applicant or any successor in title must maintain yearly logs of maintenance which should be carried out in accordance with the approved Maintenance Plan. These must be available for inspection upon a request by the Local Planning Authority.
13. No development shall take place until a Phase 1 Land Contamination investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 1 investigation. The completed Phase 1 report shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of any necessary Phase 2 investigation. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "Model Procedures for the Management of Land Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the Phase 2 site investigation condition that follows.]

14. Should the Phase 1 Land Contamination preliminary risk assessment carried out under the above condition identify the presence of potentially unacceptable risks, no development shall take place until a Phase 2 site investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 2 investigation. The completed Phase 2 investigation report, together with any necessary outline remediation options, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to any redevelopment or remediation works being carried out. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "Model Procedures for the Management of Land Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the remediation scheme condition that follows.]

15. Should Land Contamination Remediation Works be identified as necessary under the above condition, no development shall take place until a detailed remediation scheme to bring the site to a condition suitable for the intended use has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved remediation scheme unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The remediation scheme must include all works to be undertaken, proposed remediation objectives and remediation criteria, timetable of works and site management procedures and any necessary long term maintenance and monitoring programme. The scheme must ensure that the site will not qualify as contaminated land under Part 2A of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 or any subsequent version, in relation to the intended use of the land after remediation.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the verification report condition that follows.]

16. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme and prior to the first use or occupation of the development, a verification report that demonstrates the effectiveness of the remediation carried out must be produced together with any necessary monitoring and maintenance programme and copies of any waste transfer notes relating to exported and imported soils shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. The approved monitoring and maintenance programme shall be implemented.
17. In the event that any evidence of potential contamination is found at any time when carrying out the approved development that was not previously identified in the approved Phase 2 report, it must be reported in writing immediately to the Local Planning Authority. An investigation and risk assessment must be undertaken in accordance with a methodology previously approved by the Local Planning

Authority. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme, a verification report must be prepared, which is subject to the approval in writing of the Local Planning Authority in accordance with the immediately above condition.

18. No development or preliminary groundworks of any kind shall take place until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
19. All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
20. No development shall take place, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority. The approved Statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The Statement shall provide for:
 1. the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;
 2. loading and unloading of plant and materials;
 3. storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
 4. the erection and maintenance of security hoarding including decorative displays and facilities for public viewing, where appropriate;
 5. measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during construction, including wheel washing;
 6. a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works; and
 7. safe access into the site.
21. No bonfires shall be permitted on site throughout the demolition and construction phase of the development.
22. Prior to first occupation of the development the access arrangements and associated highway works, as shown in principle on drawing no. TS Diagram 3 Rev G, shall be implemented with all details being agreed with the Highway Authority, to include, but not limited to, the following:
 - a bellmouth access with minimum radii of 6m;
 - provision of visibility splays clear to ground level of 2.4m x 40m to the north and 2.4m x 38m to the south;
 - provision of pedestrian dropped kerb crossing points across the bellmouth with appropriate tactile paving;
 - the reinstatement of the parking layby to the south of the access to footway, with the possible provision of bollards;
 - provision of parking restrictions around the new bellmouth access to keep the visibility splays clear onto Pyrles Lane; and
 - provision of a minimum carriageway width of 4.3m into the site.
23. Prior to first occupation of the development, the Developer shall be responsible for the provision and implementation, per dwelling, of a

Residential Travel Information Pack for sustainable transport, approved by Essex County Council, to include six one-day travel vouchers for use with the relevant local public transport operator.

24. Prior to first occupation of the development a Size 3 turning head shall be provided within the site and maintained as such in perpetuity.
25. The number of parking spaces and how these are laid out (including dimensions) shall be in accordance with the Parking Standards Design and Good Practice Guide Supplementary Planning Guidance Document September 2009 unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority. This applies to all vehicular parking spaces including disabled requirements together with cycle parking and facilities for powered two wheelers and garages that are considered as parking spaces.
26. The public's rights and ease of passage over public footpath no.110 Loughton shall be maintained free and unobstructed at all times.
27. No development hereby approved shall take place until measures to enable the provision of education improvements to the local area, necessitated by this development, are secured.
28. The development hereby approved shall not take place until measures to secure the provision of a minimum of 40% of the total number of units to be affordable housing are in place by means of a legal undertaking with the Local Planning Authority to an agreed tenure mix, development mix, form of affordable housing and delivered by one of the Council's Preferred Housing Association partners in accordance with the Required Terms for Affordable Housing attached as informative No. 4 to this decision notice.
29. The development hereby approved shall not be commenced until details of the hard surfacing of footpath number 110, linking Pyrles Lane, Millennium Park and Hillyfields, have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. Once approved, these details shall be implemented in full before any of the residential units are first occupied.
30. A water supply to the adjoining site, shown as "Allotment Gardens" on drawing number 2, shall be provided and retained during the period of demolition and construction, and retained permanently thereafter once the development is occupied. Details of this provision shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority before any works commence on site.
31. No removal of vegetation shall take place between 1 March and 31 August inclusive, unless a competent ecologist has undertaken a careful, detailed check of vegetation for active birds' nests immediately before the vegetation is cleared and provided written confirmation that no birds will be harmed and/or that there are appropriate measures in place to protect nesting bird interest on site. Any such written confirmation should be submitted to and agreed by the Local Planning Authority.

32. Three of the mature trees located within the survey area were identified with high bat roost potential. Current plans show that these trees will be retained within the development. These trees shall be protected during the development to ensure there are no negative impacts as a result of increased noise, dust and vibration in the vicinity of the trees.
33. A lighting plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. Lighting for the final development and during construction shall be designed to avoid potential impact on bats. No additional lighting should be erected close to or directed towards the retained trees either in the final development or during construction. Guidelines from the Bat Conservation Trust shall be followed.
34. Prior to the removal, the compost heaps and other suitable features that may provide suitable habitat for reptiles shall be searched in the presence of an ecologist at a suitable time of year. Any measures recommended for the protection of reptiles shall be implemented in full.
35. Prior to commencement of development, details of bird and bat boxes shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority and implemented in accordance with such agreed details.
36. If the development does not commence within two years from the date of the ecological survey (September 2014), a further Phase 1 ecological survey shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. Where the survey results indicate that changes have occurred that will result in ecological impacts not previously addressed in the original scheme, amended measures, and a timetable for their implementation, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development. Works will then be carried out in accordance with the proposed new approved ecological measures and timetable.

57. EPF/2701 - LAND AT BROWNING'S FARMHOUSE, GRAVEL LANE, CHIGWELL

The Principal Planning Officer presented a report for the erection of a two-bedroom dwelling house on land at Brownings Farmhouse, Gravel Lane in Chigwell. This application had been considered at Area Planning Sub-Committee South on 3 February 2016, where planning permission was refused. However, four members of the Sub-Committee stood to refer the application to this Committee under the Minority Reference rules within the Constitution.

The Principal Planning Officer stated that the site contained a two-storey listed Farmhouse with a converted Barn used as a residential annexe to the main building, and was within a rural Green Belt locality. The application was concerned with the eastern section of the site which comprised the garden of the listed Farmhouse building. A Barn was located in this part of the site within significant trees that screened it from view. However, the Barn had been recently demolished without permission, and further unauthorised works had been carried out to erect a building in a similar position. The application submitted was for the extension of the Barn and its re-use as two-bedroom residential accommodation ancillary to the main farmhouse. An inspection of the site by Officers found that the construction process had already begun, which had resulted in the demolition of the Barn, and that the

description of the proposed development was incorrect. Therefore, the description of the application used for this report was the more apt "*erection of a two-bedroom dwelling house*".

The Principal Planning Officer added that the demolished Barn had had a floor area of 56m² whereas the proposed building would have a floor area of 275m² based on the proposal having two floors. It was also highlighted that an application for Listed Building consent was withdrawn before the application was considered by Area Planning Sub-Committee South, and Officers were of the opinion that the Barn was probably not a curtilage Listed Building. It was regrettable that the Barn had been demolished and substantial building work undertaken on the proposed replacement building without planning permission having first been obtained.

Planning Officers had concluded that the proposed development was inappropriate development in the metropolitan Green Belt, as it was substantially larger than the building it would replace and would harm the openness of the Green Belt. The footprint, height and appearance of the proposed building was also of an unacceptable design and would harm the setting of the listed Farmhouse. There had also been inadequate provision made for the retention of existing trees. Therefore, it was recommended that planning permission be refused. The 'Way Forward' for the Applicant would be to either re-instate the previous building on the site or construct a new single-storey building of a similar size to the demolished Barn. In addition, an arboricultural impact assessment for the existing trees on the site should also be undertaken.

The Committee noted the summary of representations received in relation to the application. There had been one letter received from the Parish Council in support of the application. The Committee proceeded to debate the application.

Cllr Knapman expressed concern over the length of time taken to resolve the application, and highlighted the medical condition of the Applicant, who wanted to move from the existing Farmhouse to a new home on the site of the former Barn. The Member felt that Officers were right to halt the construction of the replacement building as it was too large; however, the height of the proposed building had now been reduced to one storey and the footprint would be approximately the same as the previous Barn. Any increase would not exceed 40% of the size of the previous building.

A number of other Members were opposed to the application and supported the Officer's recommendation to refuse planning permission. Reasons cited included that the surrounding area had an open aspect with houses scattered across the landscape within the Green Belt; the proposed development was too large and would be highly visible; the proposal was a replacement as the Barn had already been demolished; the building would eventually become a separate dwelling within the Green Belt; and the proposed development would have a huge impact on the Green Belt and the setting of the Listed Building.

When questioned about the means of access to the proposed new building, the Principal Planning Officer stated that there was an access to an adjacent field next to the building, but no vehicular access had been shown on the drawings. However, this had not been considered as a reason for refusal. It was also highlighted that planning enforcement action at the site had been deferred pending the decision on this planning application, and if the application was refused then the Council would proceed with enforcement action.

The Committee voted to refuse planning permission as per the recommendation of Planning Officers. The Committee felt that there was no way forward for this application as none of the original Barn was intact.

Resolved:

(1) That Planning Application EPF/2701/15 at Land at Brownings Farmhouse, Gravel Lane in Chigwell be refused permission for the following reasons:

1. The proposed building would be materially larger than the building it replaced. It therefore represented inappropriate development which would cause harm to the openness of the Green Belt. The proposal was therefore contrary to the National Planning Policy Framework and contrary to policy and GB2A of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations, which was consistent with the NPPF.
2. The proposed building, by reason of its size, form and appearance, constituted an excessively large building which also had an untraditional form and design inconsistent with its setting. This size and profile, together with a poor porch design and inappropriate roof slate, would result in a building of poor design that would detract from the appearance and setting of the listed farmhouse on the site as well as the character and appearance of the locality. The proposal was therefore contrary to policies CP2(i), DBE1, DBE4 and HC12 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations, and contrary to the National Planning Policy Framework.
3. By reason of its siting within the root protection zone of adjacent trees the proposal was likely to cause significant harm to them that would be likely to adversely impact on the visual amenities of the locality. Such harm was not assessed in any arboricultural impact assessment and, furthermore, no justified mitigation that might be required was proposed. It was therefore concluded the proposal did not make adequate provision for the retention of trees, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy LL10, which was consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

58. EPF/2197/15 - 15 OAKWOOD HILL INDUSTRIAL ESTATE, OAKWOOD HILL, LOUGHTON

The Principal Planning Officer presented a report for the installation of 2-storey business units, together with associated welfare facilities and parking, at Unit 15 Oakwood Hill Industrial Estate in Loughton. This application was before the Committee as it was considered a Major planning application with the development of commercial floor space in excess of 1000m². The Council owned the freehold of the site.

The Principal Planning Officer reported that the application site was located within the Oakwood Hill Industrial Estate and included the ground floor of unit 15A. The site backed on to the London Underground railway line and was visible from Oakwood Hill as it was directly opposite the entrance road to the estate. The Estate was designated as an employment area and was not within either the metropolitan Green Belt or a Conservation Area.

The Principal Planning Officer stated that the proposal sought permission for the installation of two storey business units – part single-storey and part two-storey café

– which would be formed from shipping containers creating 34 individual business incubator units. The first floor units would be accessed by an external stairway and walkway. The café would also be housed within the shipping containers with one of the containers creating a new undercroft vehicle and link the existing business units 15A and 15B at first floor level. The existing ground floor of unit 15A would serve as a communal area providing toilets, kitchen facilities, board room, waste area and a cycle store. The proposal also included 14 additional car parking spaces within the site.

The Principal Planning Officer informed the Committee Officers had concluded that, although unusual, the proposal would add to the vitality and promotion of a designated employment area and the wider District; there were no amenity issues to consider. There was an existing parking problem in the area, but a number of new parking spaces were proposed and the application was considered acceptable given the sustainable location of the site. Therefore, the application was recommended for approval.

The Committee noted the Summary of Representations. Three objections had been received, predominantly concerned with parking issues in the local area. Loughton Town Council had no objection to the revised application, and the Loughton Residents Association had withdrawn their objection following the undertaking of an additional parking survey during school term time.

Resolved:

(1) That planning application EPF/2197/15 at Unit 15 Oakwood Hill Industrial Estate in Loughton be granted permission, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
2. The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with the approved drawings nos: 1.01, 1.02, 1.03, 1.04, 1.05, 1.11, 1.12, 1.13, 1.14, 1.21 and 1.22 all dated 11/12/2015
3. No construction works above ground level shall take place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority, in writing. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
4. A flood risk assessment and management and maintenance plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development. The assessment shall include calculations of increased run-off and associated volume of storm detention using WinDes or other similar best practice tools. The approved measures shall be carried out prior to the substantial completion of the development and shall be adequately maintained in accordance with the management and maintenance plan.
5. No development shall take place until a Phase 1 Land Contamination investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 1 investigation. The completed Phase 1 report shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the

commencement of any necessary Phase 2 investigation. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "Model Procedures for the Management of Land Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the Phase 2 site investigation condition that follows]

6. Should the Phase 1 Land Contamination preliminary risk assessment carried out under the above condition identify the presence of potentially unacceptable risks, no development shall take place until a Phase 2 site investigation has been carried out. A protocol for the investigation shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority before commencement of the Phase 2 investigation. The completed Phase 2 investigation report, together with any necessary outline remediation options, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to any redevelopment or remediation works being carried out. The report shall assess potential risks to present and proposed humans, property including buildings, crops, livestock, pets, woodland and service lines and pipes, adjoining land, ground waters and surface waters, ecological systems, archaeological sites and ancient monuments and the investigation must be conducted in accordance with DEFRA and the Environment Agency's "Model Procedures for the Management of Land Contamination, CLR 11", or any subsequent version or additional regulatory guidance.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the remediation scheme condition that follows]

7. Should Land Contamination Remediation Works be identified as necessary under the above condition, no development shall take place until a detailed remediation scheme to bring the site to a condition suitable for the intended use has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved remediation scheme unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The remediation scheme must include all works to be undertaken, proposed remediation objectives and remediation criteria, timetable of works and site management procedures and any necessary long term maintenance and monitoring programme. The scheme must ensure that the site will not qualify as contaminated land under Part 2A of the Environmental Protection Act 1990 or any subsequent version, in relation to the intended use of the land after remediation.

[Note: This condition must be formally discharged by the Local Planning Authority before the submission of details pursuant to the verification report condition that follows]

8. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme and prior to the first use or occupation of the development, a verification report that demonstrates the effectiveness of the remediation carried out must be produced together with any necessary monitoring and maintenance programme and copies of any waste transfer notes relating to exported and imported soils shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. The approved monitoring and maintenance programme shall be implemented.
9. In the event that any evidence of potential contamination is found at any time when carrying out the approved development that was not previously identified in the approved Phase 2 report, it must be reported in writing immediately to the Local Planning Authority. An investigation and risk assessment must be undertaken in accordance with a methodology previously approved by the Local Planning Authority. Following completion of measures identified in the approved remediation scheme, a verification report must be prepared, which is subject to the approval in writing of the Local Planning Authority in accordance with the immediately above condition.
10. The development hereby permitted shall not be commenced until detailed design and method statements (in consultation with London Underground), have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority which:
 1. provide details on the use of scaffolding or tall plant; and
 2. provide details on the installation of shipping containers.
11. Prior to the first occupation of the development the vehicle parking and turning areas as indicated on the approved plans shall be provided, hard surfaced, sealed and marked out. The parking and turning areas shall be retained in perpetuity for their intended purpose.
12. No development shall take place, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority. The approved Statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The Statement shall provide for:
 1. the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;
 2. loading and unloading of plant and materials;
 3. storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
 4. the erection and maintenance of security hoarding including decorative displays and facilities for public viewing, where appropriate;
 5. measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during construction, including wheel washing; and
 6. a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works.

13. All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
14. There shall be no open storage.

59. EPF/3058/15 - THE DRUMMONDS, SIDNEY ROAD, THEYDON BOIS

The Principal Planning Officer presented a report for the removal of condition 3, garage for storage of motor vehicles, for planning permission EF/1286/91 (two-storey side extension to form 'granny annexe') at The Drummonds, Sidney Road in Theydon Bois. This application was before the Committee because the Applicant was a serving District Councillor.

The Principal Planning Officer reported that the application site consisted of a detached chalet style bungalow, that had previously been extended with a two-storey side extension. The site was located in a cul-de-sac and was surrounded by similar residential properties; there was a Tennis Club at the end of the cul-de-sac. The property had an 'in-out' driveway that was capable of accommodating at least three cars, and was outside the metropolitan Green Belt.

The Principal Planning Officer stated that the two-storey side extension had an integral single garage on the ground floor, and the proposal was to convert the garage to additional habitable space accommodation. The external door of the garage would be replaced with brickwork and a window to match that already existing. Such a proposal would normally be 'permitted development', but condition 3 of the planning permission to build the extension had stated that the garage should be retained for the storage of motor vehicles and not be converted into an additional room. Therefore, the application sought to remove this condition to allow the garage to be converted into a room.

The Principal Planning Officer informed the Committee Planning Officers had concluded that there was sufficient space for vehicles to park in front of the house on the driveway so as not to lead to additional on-street parking. The proposal complied with relevant planning policy and was recommended for approval.

The Committee noted the summary of representations. No comments had been received from the neighbouring properties and the Parish Council had not raised any objection.

Resolved:

(1) That planning application EPF/3058/15 at The Drummonds, Sidney Road in Theydon Bois be granted permission, subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
2. Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing two-storey front bay, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

60. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no other urgent business for consideration by the Committee.

61. EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC AND PRESS

The Committee noted that there was no business to be considered that necessitated the exclusion of the public and press.

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank